

A Way Forward

THIS PRESENTATION IS BEYOND A "YES" OR "NO" OF THE TMT PROJECT. THIS IS ABOUT ASKING HAWAI'T'S PEOPLE TO COME TOGETHER AND FINDING A PATH TO GO FORWARD IN A GOOD WAY.

In recent years, the Hōkūle'a gave birth to a phenomenal Hawaiian cultural renaissance, re-igniting the Hawaiians' desire to discover, grow and explore new frontiers; with this, the pride of the wisdom and courage of their elders.

In recent months, Maunakea has added to this remarkable Hawaiian cultural renaissance, the Hawaiians' identity and the pride of being Hawaiian; with this, the reverence and sacredness for the total environment.

When respectfully integrated with a comprehensive understanding of Maunakea and Hawaiian culture, astronomy can be such a catalyst for positive and transformational changes in Hawai'i.

Under the leadership of dreamers, innovators, and awakened community, this can be the leverage for not only Maunakea issues, but to understand and address wrongs of past to make us a better people and place.-

- Mayor Harry Kim, 2019

Foundations Laid to Acknowledge and Honor the Hawaiian Heritage

WE PLEDGE TO BUILD ON THESE FOUNDATIONS

GOVERNANCE

- 1978 Rights of Native Hawaiians ~ Constitutional amendment recognizes customary and traditional rights of Native Hawaiians.
- 1978 Office of Hawaiian Affairs ~ Constitutional amendment creates the Office of Hawaiian Affairs to begin to right extensive wrongs suffered by the indigenous people of Hawaii and rebuild the Hawaiian nation through a public trust.
- Aloha Spirit Law ~ The Legislature enacts the Aloha Spirit Law, authored by Aunty Pilahi Paki, to preserve the essence of Hawaiian culture, and to set examples for kindness, unity, humility and patience to the world.
- Apology Resolution ~ Congress and President Bill Clinton acknowledge the United States' role in the illegal overthrow of the Kingdom of Hawai'i in 1893 and that the Native Hawaiian people have never abandoned claims to sovereignty of their lands; thus, furthering the momentum of the Hawaiian sovereignty movement.

LANGUAGE AND EDUCATION

- Hawaiian Language ~ State Constitution recognizes Hawaiian as an official language; today, it is one of two states to give indigenous languages the same status as English. (Alaska being the second state)
- Hawaiian Studies Program ~ The University of Hawaii at Mānoa and Hilo offers world-class, innovative programs, including undergraduate and graduate degrees, in Hawaiian Language to perpetuate the culture and result in fluent Hawaiian language speakers who are committed to and live the Hawaiian culture. The Hawaiian Language program also offers certificate programs.
- Ka Papahana Kaiapuni ~ The State Department of Education creates the K-12 Ka Papahana Kaiapuni Hawai'i Language Immersion Program for public and charter schools, complementing the Pūnana Leo Hawaiian language private preschools, to ensure keiki are raised with 'Ōlelo Hawai'i and can teach future generations. The program has grown from an enrollment of 152 in 1990 to 3,100 in 2017, graduating 21 successive classes of students through 2019.
- 1997
 Ka Haka 'Ula O Ke'elikōlani ~ To revitalize Hawaiian language and culture, UH-Hilo establishes the Ka Haka 'Ula O Ke'elikōlani College of Hawaiian Language, the only school focused on indigenous language at a comprehensive public university. This enables UH-Hilo to provide not only bachelors and masters programs in Hawaiian Studies and language, but a world-leading PhD program that has positioned UH-Hilo as a global leader in indigenous language revitalization efforts for the world. Ka Haka 'Ula has also taken on a leadership role in preparing teachers for Hawaiian Immersion schools across the islands.
- 1997 Ka Huli Ao Center For Excellence In Native Hawaiian Law ~ The UH Law School establishes an academic center that promotes education, scholarship, community outreach and collaboration on issues of law, culture and justice for Native Hawaiians and other Pacific and Indigenous peoples.
- The John A. Burns School of Medicine at UH Mānoa ~ Establishes the Department of Native Hawaiian Health to develop a comprehensive program to improve the healthcare status of Native Hawaiians, including through the Native Hawaiian Center of Excellence and the 'Imi Ho'ōla Program.

LANGUAGE AND EDUCATION

- 2006 'Imiloa Astronomy Center ~ As part of the University of Hawai'i at Hilo, 'Imiloa brings together members of the Hawaiian and astronomy communities to share a common vision for the future, bringing information about cultural and natural history of Maunakea each year to 66,000 students, teachers, local residents and visitors from around the world.
- Hawaiʻinuiākea School of Hawaiian Knowledge ~ Starting in 1970 as a Hawaiian Studies option in Liberal Studies that has grown to the nation's only indigenous college in a research institution, approved by the Board of Regents in 2007, the school offers bachelors and masters degrees to "pursue, perpetuate, reach and revitalize all areas and forms of Hawaiian knowledge. The college includes Kamakakūokalani Hawaiian Studies Program, Kawaihuelani Center for Hawaiian Language, Ka Papa Loʻi O Kānewai Cultural Garden, and Native Hawaiian Student Services. The services program supports an estimated 2,600 Hawaiian students annually, the largest body of indigenous students in any post-secondary educational institution in the world.

CULTURE

- Merrie Monarch ~ The County of Hawai'i establishes the Merrie Monarch Festival to acknowledge Hawa'i's unique culture and to celebrate hula. Dottie Thompson, Director of Parks and Recreation, was appointed to lead the development of the festival. The Merrie Monarch Festival is now a world-class event showcasing the Hawaiian culture and celebrating hula.
- Island Burial Councils ~ In response to the desecration and disregard of Hawaiian burials, the State Legislature areates the Island Burial Council system to care for ancestral remains of Native Hawaiian burial sites in a respectful and appropriate manner.
- Kahoʻolawe Island Reserve Commission ~ Following bombing and decades of inappropriate land use, the State Legislature establishes the Kahoʻolawe Island Reserve Commission to restore native ecosystems and manage the Kahoʻolawe Island Reserve in trust, pending a future Native Hawaiian sovereign entity assuming authority.
- Year of the Hawaiian Proclamation ~ In recognition of the growing renaissance of the Native Hawaiian culture, the Governor proclaimed 2018 as the Year of the Hawaiian. The proclamation asks "the people of the Aloha State to join us in understanding the value of Native Hawaiian cultural practices and recognize the Native Hawaiians for their achievements and contributions."

Issues of Astronomy on Maunakea — Issues of Astronomy on Maunakea

POOR MANAGEMENT

"Too many telescopes"

The cumulative impacts of observatory development on the mountain have been recognized as being "substantial, significant, and adverse" (TMT Environmental Impact Statement).

Response: The University of Hawai'i has made a legally-binding commitment that the TMT site will be the last new area to be developed for observatories and has committed to the removal of 5 current observatories by the end of 2033 as a condition of the TMT permit. A decommissioning sub-plan, under the Maunakea Comprehensive Management Plan, guides the removal of observatories and site restoration.

TMT Conservation District Use Permit

- Three of the existing 13 telescopes to be permanently removed as soon as reasonably possible, but no later than the time TMT is complete.
 - Caltech Submillimeter Observatory began decommissioning process in 2017. A public scoping period ended in 2018. Hoku Kea decommissioning also underway. UKIRT is identified for removal.
- Two more by the current end of UH's lease in 2033.
- None of these sites will be redeveloped.

If TMT is built, there will be no more than nine telescopes beyond 2033. This is a commitment.

"Too many visitors"

Maunakea remains a popular attraction for tourists and residents, prompting concerns about visitor impacts to the mountain. According to Maunakea Support Services, 35,511 vehicles ascended the mountain in 2016, with observatory crews and permitted tours accounting for about 37 percent of vehicle traffic that year. The rest is attributed to the general public including visitors.

Response: UH is developing administrative rules to address access issues. Other steps to address access include:

Ranger Program

Shortly after its founding in fall 2000, the Office of Maunakea Management created a ranger program to provide daily oversight of activities on UH managed lands. It is the goal of the administration to expand the ranger program.

Public Access Sub-Plan

- As part of the Maunakea Comprehensive Management Plan, this sub-plan sets principles and policies to guide public and commercial activities.
- To be implemented through administrative rules.

Issues of Astronomy on Maunakea ——Issues of Astronomy on Maunakea

"Isolated bureaucracy"

The Legislative Auditor issued a critical audit in 1998 of UH's management.

Response: The University of Hawai'i completed a Master Plan for Maunakea and formed the Office of Maunakea Management under UH-Hilo in 2000 to relocate management from 'Oahu to Hawai'i Island.

OMKM

- Overseen by a board of community members nominated by the UH-Hilo chancellor and approved by the UH Board of Regents.
- Advised by a Native Hawaiian cultural council, known as Kahu Kū Mauna.
- Completed Comprehensive Management Plan in 2009. The CMP incorporates four sub-plans: Cultural Resources, Natural Resources, Public Access, and Decommissioning.

NOT PAYING FAIR SHARE

Observatories, while providing significant economic benefits, have paid \$1 a year for their subleases under UH, prompting concern they aren't paying their share for use of public lands.

Response: TMT is the only sublease entered into after the Legislative Audit and 2000 Master Plan, and therefore the first telescope to pay substantial lease rent. Substantial lease payments will be included in any new and renegotiated sublease agreements.

TMT sub-lease

- Sub-lease validated in 2018 following legal challenges.
- Payments start at \$300,000 annually and will reach \$1.08 million annually after 10 years.
- Payments benefit Office of Maunakea Management for stewardship and management, and Office of Hawaiian Affairs.

DISRESPECT OF HAWAIIAN CULTURE

Maunakea is recognized for its wahi pana and other highly valued cultural and natural resources. It is also recognized as a premier site for astronomy. The Legislative Auditor in 1998 faulted UH for not doing enough to protect the cultural and natural resources when building observatories.

Response: Restrictions were imposed by the UH management plans and TMT Conservation District Use Permit:

UH management plans

Environmental, cultural and architectural controls developed.

Issues of Astronomy on Maunakea ——Issues of Astronomy on Maunakea

Controls address development on pu'u.

TMT Conservation District Use Permit

- Site designated at an area below the summit and away from historical and cultural sites, including Kūkahau'ula and Lake Waigu. No burials at the site.
- All waste from the observatory will be stored and removed.
- No explosives to be used during construction.

INADEQUATE COMMUNITY BENEFIT

The primary beneficiaries of astronomy have narrowly been the UH and scientists.

Response: To broaden the benefits of astronomy to the community, the observatories and 'Imiloa Astronomy Center have supported several programs, including the following:

Maunakea Observatories

• Several million dollars spent on education and workforce development including Journey Through the Universe, Akamai internships, AstroDays, Kama'āina Observatory Experience, and Maunakea Scholars program, which gives Hawai'i high school students access to the telescopes for observations and research. Maunakea Scholars

program remains the only program of its kind in the world.

'Imiloa Astronomy Center

 A Hug He Inog: Native Hawaiian students work with astronomers and Hawaiian language experts to give Hawaiian names to astronomical discoveries. Names have been submitted and accepted by the International Astronomical Union.

Thirty Meter Telescope

 In 2014, TMT International Observatory launched the THINK Fund, which provides \$1 million a year to STEM education on Hawai'i Island. Annual payments adjusted for inflation will continue for the life of the observatory.



Our Pledge

David Ige

Governor State of Hawaiʻi



RESTRUCTURE MANAGEMENT OF MAUNAKEA. I will administratively restructure the management of Maunakea to include representation by the Hawaiian community and by County government, while working with the Legislature for permanent restructuring of management.

DHHL Housing Support. I commit to work with DHHL and the Legislature to seek additional resources to increase housing on DHHL lands.

David Ige | Sept. 12, 2019

David Lassner

President University of Hawaiʻi



RESTRUCTURE MANAGEMENT OF MAUNAKEA. I will work with the Governor, the Native Hawaiian community, and the Mayor to restructure a collaborative approach to stewardship of the mauna as articulated by the UH Board of Regents.

CULTURAL FACILITY. I commit to establishing a facility to celebrate and honor Hawaiian history, knowledge, culture and language, along with modern science and astronomy, on the already developed land at Hale Pōhaku under guidance by the Native Hawaiian community.

CULTURAL PRACTITIONERS SITE. I commit to set aside lands at the summit, if desired, for the sole use of cultural practitioners.

CULTURE AND SCIENCE INTEGRATION. I commit to pursue broadening the cultural/educational mission at Hale Pōhaku to fully integrate Hawaiian cosmology, astronomy, language and cultural knowledge into research and teaching activities of the observatories.

Our Pledge

William Ailā

Interim Chairman Department of Hawaiian Home Lands



HOUSING. We will work with Hawai'i County and other state agencies to expedite approval of DHHL subdivisions. We will provide innovative homestead opportunities, such as subsistence agricultural awards, tiny homes, and other efforts, to put beneficiaries on DHHL land.

William Ailā | Sept. 12, 2019

Ed Stone

Executive Director TMT International Observatory



SUSTAINABLE ASTRONOMY. We commit to working toward this vision of Maunakea and the development of a new paradigm of sustainable astronomy on Maunakea founded on integrating culture, science, the environment and education, as demonstrated by the 10-plus-year consultation process, which included the Kahu Kū Mauna Council, Native Hawaiian cultural practitioners and other community members. This led to a development plan and permit which addressed concerns about impacts on the environment and cultural and historical sites.

GOOD NEIGHBOR. We commit to continue working with the community, to being good stewards of the mountain, and good neighbors on our island home. Efforts in the past have included the THINK Fund to benefit educational programs and scholarships, and the Akamai Workforce Initiative that has placed college students in summer internships at observatories and other high-tech companies in Hawai'i.

Ed Stone | Sept. 12, 2019

Our Pledge

DIRECTORS OF THE MAUNAKEA OBSERVATORIES

THE MAUNAKEA OBSERVATORIES SUPPORTS THE VISION FOR MAUNAKEA AND RECOGNIZE THE FOLLOWING AS ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS IN YOUR "VISION FOR MAUNAKEA":

- The harmony that can grow from acknowledging a painful history of intrusions on the First Nation of Hawai'i.
- The importance of protecting the cultural and historical significance of Maunakea.
- The necessity to build a bright future for all people in Hawai'i in the spirit of aloha.
- The potential of Hawai'i setting an international example of diversity in these challenging times.
- The unique value of Maunakea in the pursuit of knowledge about the Universe.
- The opportunity of Maunakea becoming a global beacon of hope, peace, and discovery —

The Maunakea observatories are integral members of the Hawai'i community and whole-heartedly support these pillars in your vision. Maunakea should be recognized as a place where cultural, scientific, and environmental interests don't simply coincide, but instead support one another for Maunakea to thrive as a whole. We deeply appreciate the importance of Maunakea to a broad cross section of our community and we are thankful and privileged to study the universe from the Maunakea summit — a unique portal on the universe and our origins.

MAUNAKEA OBSERVATORIES

Letter to Mayor Harry Kim signed by all Directors of the Maunakea Observatories

March 28, 2019

Hoku Kea Observatory Gemini Observatory Subaru Telescope

Canada-France-Hawai'i Telescope James Clerk Maxwell Telescope Institute for Astronomy Long Baseline Observatory **NASA Infrared Telescope Facility**

UKIRT (United Kingdom Infra-Red Telescope) W.M. Keck Observatory (Keck I and Keck II)

Our Pledge

Harry Kim

Mayor County of Hawai'i



PARTICIPATE IN MANAGEMENT OF MAUNAKEA. County government commits to designating County representation in high-level decision-making relating to management of Maunakea and supporting the restructuring of the management of Maunakea.

THE NEXT STEP FORWARD

CONVENE A CORE GROUP OF COMMUNITY MEMBERS WHO BELIEVE AND SUPPORT THE VISION. THE RESPONSIBILITIES OF THIS GROUP ARE TO PROVIDE DIRECTION AND GUIDANCE IN BRINGING THIS VISION TO LIFE.

Harry Kim | Sept. 12, 2019

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This proposal is a result of many conversations and meetings over the past years with government leaders, quardians of the mountain, community, spiritual leaders, and scientists. While interest and positions were diverse, each shared a deep love and commitment to what is good for Maunakea and Hawai'i. The innumerable hours spent in these discussions has deepened my own understanding and appreciation of Maunakea and the Hawaiian people. All meetings ended with a positive relationship that is so appreciated.

Our challenge is such a difficult one simply because of the complexity of the issue. This proposal of a way forward is just a step building upon the foundation laid to address wrongs of past and to find a way to make things better.

Vision for Maunakea

THIS IS ABOUT WHAT MAUNAKEA CAN BE FOR THE WORLD

Maunakea to be a symbol of nations working together for the pursuit of peace and harmony, a beacon of hope and discovery for the world. This is not just about science. It is about combining culture and science. It is about respect and caring. It is about a quest for knowledge that will make us a better people and better stewards of this world.

- It is about Hawai'i to be globally recognized as a cultural and natural treasure. Hawai'i, a place on this earth where people live together peacefully and respectfully in harmony with nature. This is about Hawai'i and the cosmopolitan people (people of the world) where diversity is respected and celebrated.
- This is about the recognition of a deeply painful history of intrusions on the First Nation of Hawai'i, which today are reflected in issues such as Maunakea. It is about the wrongs done to indigenous people of the world whose scars remain fresh.
- Maunakea to be an opportunity for the gift of aloha to be presented to the world to make us better. This is about the mountain bringing people together.

INITIATIVES OF THE VISION

- **Cultural Treasure:** Create a major cultural center to protect and preserve the historical and cultural specialness of Hawai'i and its people.
- **Science:** Create science programs that emphasize the inseparability of nature and culture.
- **Education:** Create educational programs that connect the wonders of science to the minds of children and adults.
- **Management:** Establish an umbrella management authority that gives strong deference to the voices of the host island and the Hawaiian community.
- **Beacon of hope for the world:** Be a model of how the people of the world can live together in harmony and the opportunity of Maunakea becoming a global beacon of hope, peace and discovery.

"The world will turn to Hawai'i as they search for world peace because Hawai'i has the key ... and that key is aloha." Aunty Pibli Poki, 1970